

1 ADAM J. GUTRIDE (State Bar No. 181446)
adam@gutridesafier.com
2 SETH A. SAFIER (State Bar No. 197427)
seth@gutridesafier.com
3 KRISTEN G. SIMPLICIO (State Bar No. 263291)
kristen@gutridesafier.com
4 **GUTRIDE SAFIER LLP**
100 Pine Street, Suite 1250
5 San Francisco, California 94111
Telephone: 415.271.6469
6 Facsimile: 415.449.6469

7 HASSAN A. ZAVAREEI (State Bar No. 181547)
hzavareei@tzlegal.com

8 **TYCKO & ZAVAREEI LLP**
1828 L Street, N.W., Suite 1000
9 Washington, DC 20036
10 Telephone: (202) 973-0900
 Facsimile: (202) 973-0950

11 || Attorneys for Plaintiffs and the Class

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

14 SCOTT KOLLER, CAROLYN BISSONETTE,
15 CECE CASTORO, STEPHEN FREIMAN,
16 DIANE GIBBS, DARLENE WILLIAMS, and
17 ROBERT GLIDEWELL, on behalf of
themselves, the general public and those similarly
situated,

18 || Plaintiffs.

V.

MED FOODS, INC., and DEOLEO USA,
INC.

22 || Defendants

CASE NO. 14-cv-2400 (RS)

**DECLARATION OF ELISA
ODABASHIAN IN SUPPORT OF
PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR FINAL
APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION
SETTLEMENT AND APPLICATION
FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS AND
INCENTIVE AWARDS**

Date: August 9, 2018

Time: 1:30 p.m.

Dept: Courtroom 3, 17th Floor

Judge: Hon. Richard Seeborg

1 I, Elisa Odabashian, declare as follows:

2 1. I am the director of strategic initiatives and the West Coast Office of Consumers
3 Union, the advocacy arm of Consumer Reports. I submit this declaration in support of the
4 designation of Consumers Union as a proposed *gṝ près* beneficiary in *Koller v. Deoleo USA, Inc.*, No.
5 3:14-cv-02400-RS. I have been with Consumers Union for 24 years. I have personal knowledge of
6 the facts stated herein and could testify to them if called upon to do so.

7 2. As the advocacy arm of Consumer Reports, Consumers Union seeks to empower
8 consumers as they navigate their way through an increasingly complex marketplace. Consumers
9 Union works with our content providers at Consumer Reports, as well as with other non-profit
10 organizations across the country, to fight for a fairer, safer, and more transparent marketplace for
11 consumers, before state legislatures and Congress, state and federal regulatory agencies, and through
12 marketplace campaigns targeting corporate actors.

13 3. Consumers Union has a long history of working to educate and protect consumers in
14 the marketplace. Since its first issue in 1936, Consumers Union has never accepted or published paid
15 ads in Consumer Reports. Free from the pressures of advertisers and commercial influence,
16 Consumer Reports has tackled some of the toughest safety and misleading advertising issues of the
17 time, evaluating new products and technologies, warning consumers about potential dangers and
18 unfounded claims by advertisers, and fighting for accurate labeling.

19 4. Consumers Union employs attorneys, policy analysts, grassroots organizers,
20 researchers, media experts, and outreach specialists who advocate for consumer protections in the
21 areas of financial services, food safety, product safety, health care, telecommunications, and clean
22 energy. Consumers Union advocates for, sponsors and weighs in on legislation, pushes for regulatory
23 reforms, watchdogs the implementation of new laws, runs public education and marketplace
24 campaigns, supports and opposes state ballot measures, publishes reports that highlight original
25 research and surveys, and provides trusted expertise in the media. More than 1.5 million e-activists
26 have signed up to follow Consumers Union and take action on issues that impact them. Consumers
27 Union's stories database empowers consumers to describe their experiences in the marketplace dealing
28 with misleading advertising, and unsafe products and practices—or to describe their interactions with

1 good corporate actors. We work with the story sharers to develop and fact-check their stories, and
 2 with permission, provide them to reporters who are writing about a particular problem in the
 3 marketplace, and to legislators who are looking for examples of the problem their legislation is
 4 endeavoring to fix. People who share their stories with us become some of Consumers Union's most
 5 active and engaged volunteers.

6 5. Consumers Union has long been on the cutting edge of reporting risks and advocating
 7 for transparency and improvements in quality and safety of the consumer marketplace, fights for
 8 accurate labeling and consumer protections in the products and services that consumers often
 9 encounter in the marketplace, and is tireless in its efforts on behalf of its only constituency—the
 10 public. Accordingly, Consumers Union has extensive consumer protection and advocacy experience
 11 within the field of food labeling and advertising. For example, Consumers Union has been working to
 12 educate consumers and lawmakers about (1) misleading claims on food product labels, (2) food
 13 labeling laws that could clarify the terms “healthy” and “natural,” (3) unexpected “junk” foods and
 14 potentially misleading food labeling claims, (4) hidden sources of sodium in food products, and (5) the
 15 need for transparency in “organic”¹ and GMO labeling. Thus, Consumers Union can and intends to
 16 direct any *cy pres* award received pursuant to forward its work in the accuracy and transparency of food
 17 labeling and advertisements.

18 6. I am generally familiar with the subject matter of this litigation and the composition of
 19 the class. Consumers Union has advocates and content providers working throughout the United
 20 States and can ensure that *cy pres* funded consumer protection services reach a broad spectrum of
 21 consumers throughout the United States. Accordingly, directing *cy pres* funds to Consumers Union
 22 presents a unique opportunity to contribute funds to an organization working directly on the issues
 23 relevant to this action and on behalf of all proposed class members.

24 7. Over decades, Consumers Union and Consumer Reports have amassed a wide body of
 25 work on the mislabeling of foods. As it relates specifically to olive oil, Consumer Reports has
 26 published a number of pieces, including one from 1942 on [Oily Olive-Oil Claims](#),² from 2004 entitled,

27
 28 ² <https://www.consumerreports.org/food-safety/food-fights-fouls-and-victories/>

1 Olive Oil: A Cheap Bottle Beats A Pricier Lineup,³ from 2012 on How To Find The Best Extra-Virgin
 2 Olive Oil,⁴ and from 2013 assessing how processing impacts the risks and benefits of olive oil,
 3 entitled, Fat Facts and Fat Fiction.⁵

4 8. Consumers Union has been approved by courts as a cy pres recipient in several other
 5 class action law suits, including: *Aurora Dairy Corp. Organic Milk Marketing & Sales Practices*, 4:08-md-
 6 01907-ERW (E.D. Mo.); *Beck-Ellman v. Kaz*, 10cv2134H (DHB) (S.D. Cal.); *Dennis v. Kellogg*, 09-CV-
 7 1786-L (WMc) (S.D. Cal.); *Gay v. Tom's of Maine*, 14-cv-60604-KMM (S.D. Fla.); *Miller v. Ghirardelli*, 12-
 8 cv-04936-LB (N.D. Cal.); *Trammell v. Barbara's Bakery*, 12-cv-02664-CRB (N.D. Cal.).

9
 10 This declaration was executed this 28th day of June, 2018, at San Francisco, California. I state
 11 the foregoing under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States.

12
 13 
 14

15 _____
 16 Elisa Odabashian
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

26 ³ <https://consumersunion.org/research/olive-oil-a-cheap-bottle-beats-a-pricier-lineup/>

27 ⁴ <https://www.consumerreports.org/cro/magazine/2012/09/how-to-find-the-best-extra-virgin-olive-oil/index.htm>

28 ⁵ <https://www.consumerreports.org/cro/2013/02/fat-facts-and-fat-fiction/index.htm>